



***Philosophical – Theological Researches***

The Quarterly Journal of Qom University

Under the supervision of the vice – president for research

Vol. 10, No.4 Summer 2009

**Proprietor:** University of Qom

**Chief director:** Muhammad Zabihi, Ph.D

**Chief Editor:** Mohsen Javadi, Ph.D

---

**Board of writers**

Ahmad Beheshti, Ph.D; Gholam-Hosseyn Ebrahimi Dinani, Ph.D; Mohsen Javadi, Ph.D;  
Hojatoleslam Sadeq Larigani; Mostapha Mohaqeq Damad, Ph.D; Hojatoleslam  
Abdollah noorani; Jafar Shahnazari, Ph.D; Muhammad Zabihi, Ph.D

---

**Internal director and editorial – board director:** Mosa Ghamarzadeh

**Editor** Mahmood Mehravaran, Ph.D

**Staff:** Muhammad-Reza Shojae & Alireza Muazzami

---

**Typesetting:** Mohammad-Ali Mohammadi

---

**Note**

The Journal Philosophical – Theological Researches accepts papers on the Western and Islamic philosophy, modern and Islamic theology, mysticism, and ethics. The papers received will be published provided that they are written according to the house style of the journal. The authors will bear responsibilities for their own papers.

---

**Editorial address:** P.O.Box 37185-4171, Qom

**Tel:** 0098-251-2853311

**Fax:** 2854120

**Email:** [Falsafikalami@Qom.ac.ir](mailto:Falsafikalami@Qom.ac.ir)

---

## Index

---

### A Survey of Mental Existence in Avicenna's Viewpoint

Ghasem Kakaee & Ezat Maghsodi.....5

---

### The Nature and Hierarchy of Perception in Sheikh Eshraq's Point of View

Muhammad Maleki .....27

---

### The Soul Manifestation Process and Religious Self-awareness from Hegel's Point of View

Ali Fallah Rafee .....53

---

### Creation based on Love and the "Rule of Unity" from Ibn Arabi's point of view

Morteza Shajaree.....83

---

### A Comparative Study of the Argument from Common Consensus and That From Human Innate Nature For the Existence of God

Muhammad Muhammadrezaee .....109

---

### Plotinus' *The One* & the station of Essence

Mahdi Kahnoji .....127

---

### An Essay on Hume's Aesthetics

Mohsen Bohloli Faskhodi .....157

---

### The prophecy of philosophers based on the ideas of Sheikh Ishraq and Molla Sadra

Hosein Moghise .....177

---

### The Government of Prophet in Avicenna's Philosophy

Hadi Fanaee .....205

---

### The Creation and Fall of the Soul

Rezvan Najafi Savad Rodbari .....227

---

### Revelation in Avicenna's and Avennasar's Opinions

Muhammad Hadi Mullazade .....245

---

### The temporal creation or eternity of the world in the light of philosophy, mysticism, and theology in comparison with the religious texts

Muhammad Bonyani.....261

---

## Abstracts

---

### A Survey of Mental Existence in Avicenna's Viewpoint

Ghasem Kakaee & Ezat Maghsodi

In Islamic philosophy, although "ontology" has a very high position and a large part of discussions and issues are allocated to it, "epistemology" is not that much detailed for different reasons. One of the few issues discussed in detail in the Islamic philosophy under "ontology" is the issue of "mental existence". Among the historians of philosophy it is known that the discussion was proposed by Fakhar al-Din al-Razi, then through Khaje Nasir al-Tusi it reached the philosophers of the school of Shiraz where it was expanded, and eventually it was Molla Sadra who brought the final solution to the issue.

In this paper, that author has shown that despite this claim, the issues of mental existence including the proof of mental existence, its nature, suspicions about it, and the answers to them were discussed by the great Muslim philosopher, Avicenna, who has thought enough about them as a philosopher and all subsequent philosophers are influenced by him in this matter.

Keywords: Avicenna, mental existence, epistemology, the school of Shiraz, knowledge, mind.

---

### The Nature and Hierarchy of Perception in Sheikh Eshraq's Point of View

Muhammad Maleki

In what follows, the author has dealt with the nature and hierarchy of perception in Sheikh Eshraq's point of view. It is necessary first to explain the peripatetic theory of perception in order to pave the way for the explanation of Sheikh Eshraq's. The structure materials and evidences are comparatively arranged. Another important point in this paper emphasized on is that all the documents directly refers to the most important original books of these two Muslim sages, and no reference is made to the secondary books on the subject. Thus, analyses are only from the author; however, some indications from Rumi's and Shabestari's poems and Al-Asfar Al-Arbah has been added.

Keywords: perception, Sheikh Eshraq, peripatetic Theory, Avicenna.

---

### The Soul Manifestation Process and Religious Self-awareness from Hegel's Point of View

Ali Fallah Rafee

One of Hegel's four books is *Phenomenology of Spirit* which was published during his life time. In this book, which was a prelude to his whole philosophical system, Hegel on the one hand acknowledged the spirit as the only truth governing the world in which the trends of world recognition is mirrored, and on the other hand he elevated the scope of human understanding beyond the range of daily experience and interpreted that in the deeper layers of philosophical knowledge. Accordingly, it can even be said that the dominance of spirit over the world is somehow relying on philosophical knowledge and recognition process which is based on inner man's experience. Thus Hegel began his work from the experience of usual understanding, i.e. the certainty of senses understandable for all humans. He gradually led the course of soul evolution to the deepest layers of understanding namely perception, self-consciousness and intellect. The product of this philosophical Journey of spirit is to reach its original position called the absolute idealism. In this final stage, the absolute spirit spreads its unquestioned dominance over the world and overcomes the lack of absolute truth it felt at the beginning of its departure. Having traveled the long and meander roads in his phenomenology, Hegel had the dream of getting the true knowledge in order to prove his

big philosophical claim that was the interpretation of truth as reality and reality as truth. When the true knowledge is achieved, the world becomes "the realized wisdom", the spirit. It is in this "realized wisdom" that the particular is reconciled with the universal and Absolute Spirit or God fully reveals Himself to the universe. At this phase, Hegel's says, man and God come near to each other and thus the spirit can be seen in its unity.

Keywords: Phenomenology of spirit, Hegel, self-consciousness, deprived of consciousness, religiosity, providence.

---

#### **Creation based on Love and the "Rule of Unity" from Ibn Arabi's point of view**

Morteza Shajaree

Allah Almighty and creatures, according to mystics, are not separated from each other. Creation is the manifestation of Allah's goodness. When Allah wanted to be known, love began. Love is the first manifestation of existence, preceded by nothing. Allah Almighty is beautiful and beauty inherently deserves to be beloved. Had Allah not manifested in the attribute of His beauty, the world would have not emerged. It was through Love that the world came into existence. The principle of movement of the world has been the movement of love which still is going on.

In this article, the mystic opinion on the relationship between Allah and the creatures is analyzed, and in the light of those words of philosophers (the line of creation and the rule of Unity) it has been criticized.

Keywords: manifestation of Allah, Divine Attributes, love, eternal archetypes, pantheism, Divine Oneness

---

#### **A Comparative Study of the Argument from Common Consensus and That From Human Innate Nature For the Existence of God**

Muhammad Muhammadrezaee

This research intends to compare the common consensus argument with the innate nature argument for the existence of God. First, different versions of common consensus argument have been proposed: 1. Biological interpretations which through the generality of the belief in God go not only to prove that such a belief as an inborn idea, but also the existence of God. 2. The dilemma against skepticism which in addition to the popular belief (in God) have made use of reason in order to prove the existence of God. John Locke's criticisms and others' have also been discussed critically and the possible answers given to them by the defenders of the argument are set forth.

Then different versions of innate nature argument established by some Muslim thinkers and the suggested account of it by the author are introduced in brief. Later, Alvin Plantinga's theory which considers the belief in God as a basic belief and is very similar to innate nature argument is proposed.

Finally, having made a comparison between the common consensus argument and innate nature one, it has gone proven that the latter argument is stronger than the former, because John Locke's criticisms raised against the former fail to undermine the latter.

Keywords: common consensus argument, innate nature argument, basic belief, inborn nature, the idea of God, the belief in God.

---

#### **Plotinus' *The One* & the station of Essence**

Mahdi Kahnoji

Cosmology has always been considered by the non-Islamic and Islamic thinkers. They have made use of various methods in order to achieve such knowledge. As one of the thinkers in the history of philosophy and like Muslim mystics, Plotinus offered a coherent and logical explanation of the universe and its hierarchy. Plotinus believes that the intellectual world is composed of three hypostases or elements. These hypostases are:

The One, Nous and Soul.

Muslim mystics have found a particular hierarchy of universe. "The position of essence", they believe, is the best above all stages. Providing the documents, the author has used the analytical method to compare Plotinus' theory of *The One* with the mystical "position of essence".

Important achievements of this study are finding common aspects between theory of *The One* and the "station of essence" such as: Excellence, absoluteness, referred to without a name and a description, unknowable and etc.

Keywords: Plotinus, Islamic mysticism, The One, the Position of essence, hierarchy, emanation.

---

#### **An Essay on Hume's Aesthetics**

Mohsen Bohloli Faskhodi

In his discussions about aesthetics, Hume seeks for a key to the controversial issue of passion. He thinks things are not fine-looking in themselves, rather the mind which considers the objects creates the beauty. Apparently, he raises a paradoxical claim. On the one hand, beauty is regarded something mental and completely subjective arisen from feelings, but on the other hand not only he suggests that we can judge about a work of art assessing its aesthetic value but also we can prefer one aesthetic judgment over another which implies an evidence of objective criteria on artistic evaluation. It is taken for granted by Hume that the intersubjectivity of aesthetic perception gives rise to achieving a collective agreement about it. Embracing the importance of aesthetic experience, nonetheless, Hume puts emphasis on the role of critics, those with some characteristics whose judgments may turn into the criterion for taste which is not of the affection category, but something real.

In this paper, the author attempts to survey Hume's emphasis on the role of critics as the reference standards for different tastes of individuals.

Keywords: aesthetics, criterion for taste, the real critics, masterpieces of art, aesthetic judgments.

---

#### **The prophecy of philosophers based on the ideas of Sheikh Ishraq and Molla Sadra**

Hosein Moghise

The ancient and long history of philosophy and philosophers of nations especially of Greece are worthy of examination from different dimensions. One of such dimensions is their claim of being a prophet, or at least the claim that their views ideas and knowledge have a source from revelation. Referring to the ideas of Sohrawardi and Molla Sadra, the author has surveyed the issue in their points of view just because they have paid more time to it than the others, thus they left numerous texts and manuscripts as to the issue. Along with, however, apparent meanings and explicit texts of the Qur'an, the views of some earlier and later scholars are set forth, as well. This possibility can ultimately be strengthened that some philosophers were prophets or at least their teachings have a source from revelation, thus the contribution of all cultures in the evolutionary process of science and knowledge, both theoretical and practical, are emphasized. This process started with the first prophet Adam (PBUH), passing the long rough path through history, and will reach its final perfection by the last infallible vicegerent of Allah, Holy Mahdi (PBUH).

The result of this paper is to find a way out of the theoretical deadlock of cultural exclusivism to respect for the shared legacy of all human cultures and knowledge. As it were, our approach to other cultures, as far as they are compatible with ours, is to be taken positive. Cultural cooperation and mutual sharing of our knowledge ought to be our priority

and we'd better be optimist in the first place, unless the situation is otherwise.

Keywords: moderation, philosophy, ancient philosophers, the prophecy, Aristotle's admonitions.

---

### **The Government of Prophet in Avicenna's Philosophy**

Hadi Fanaee

One of the researches to break the impasse in "the human need for revelation and prophecy" is the evaluation and analysis of Avicenna's views, as one of the great Muslim theorists and philosophers in this area. Avicenna has proposed two angles to this issue: first, from the individual and spiritual standpoint and second from the social and secular. As regard to the former, he considers the belief in God and spiritual journey in the light of religious teachings as the right path to salvation prosperity and ascension to the degrees of perfection. In his most philosophical work of "*al-Esharat wa al-Tanbihat*", He has dedicated an attractive chapter entitled "Maghamat Alarfyn" (stations of gnostics) to examine the issue. In addition, he argued for the necessity of prophecy and religion through the need for a binding system of laws. However, Avicenna's discussion about the social and secular role of religion is to be sought for in his most detailed *the Metaphysics of al-Shifa* more than his any other books. Having proposed his arguments for the necessity of divine legislation and the need for revelation and prophecy for optimal administration of human society in this most precious philosophical work, Avicenna examined the implications and details of his theory. Providing the supreme law moral and spiritual education of people and designing the structure of the utopia and its institutions, Avicenna says, prophets pave the way for individual and collective prosperity. In this paper, the author has tried to survey and analyze this theory in full detail.

Keywords: Avicenna, the need for religion, prophecy, government, law, prosperity, the utopia of prophet, Imam.

---

### **The Creation and Fall of the Soul**

Rezvan Najafi Savad Rodbari

This paper aims to explain the fall of soul and its compatibility with physical creation of soul theory. Next to be discussed is the "treasures of God" theory. Finally, the issue amounts to the doctrine that the soul has a material evolution belonging to the body which nonetheless is compatible with its fall from the heavenly kingdom. This is because the fall of soul suggests its heavenly nature which is different from its physical nature. On the whole, all creatures, along with their physical nature, are of some heavenly nature. The former is considered as the tenuous form of the latter.

Keywords: the fall of soul, the creation of soul, the physical creation, Heavenly kingdom.

---

### **Revelation in Avicenna's and Farabi's Opinions**

Muhammad Hadi Mullazade

After the Greek philosophy had entered into Islamic worlds and Islamic rationalism movement had begun, skepticism about the truth of Islamic revelation was developed therein. Hence Muslim philosophers such as al-Farabius were on to resolve the resulting conflict between the Islamic revelation and reason. Thus, the first rational interpretation of revelation was introduced by al-Farabius and the theory was later evolved by Avicenna.

In this article, al-Farabius' theory of Islamic revelation and its related prerequisites, such as types of intellects and other human faculties have been discussed first, and then whatever changes to the theory made by Avicenna is taken into

consideration, and finally some criticisms are raised against the theory.

Keywords: revelation, reason, imagination, conjecture, Active Reason, faculties of perception.

---

**The temporal creation or eternity of the world in the light of philosophy, mysticism, and theology in comparison with the religious texts**

Muhammad Bonyani

Along with the religious doctrines dealing somehow with the issue of temporal creation of the world, some philosophers mystics and theologians have also talked about the issue in proportion of the occasion. As regard to the creation, philosophers have proposed three meanings: essential, supra-temporal, and temporal (of Molla Sadra's Transcendental Philosophy). Along with these three, two other ones are set forth: the temporal creation of theologians and mystical creation of the mystics. Religious doctrines are more compatible with the temporal creation theory of Molla Sadra as to the material world, and with eternal creation theory of Mir Damad as to the incorporeal world. Peripatetic philosophers, transcendental philosophers, and theologians all have proposed the creation of the world on the basis of hierarchical unity theory and the consideration of dependent beings as independent. In this approach, the world cannot be considered as created, but rather as the expansion of the material word and the development of its potentialities into actuality.

Having shed light on the concepts such as will, eternity, everlasting, creation, pre-existing and following the course of discussion based on the relation of dependent beings to the absolutely independent necessary being, we may propose a more coherently philosophical account of the issue. Thus by drawing a more comprehensive account from the Qur'an and the Sunna on the creation of the world, we may illustrate a better picture of the compatibility between religion and philosophy.

Keywords: creation, pre-existence, the world of creation and the world of command, temporal creation, the renewal likes, trans-substantial motion

---